MUSIC GRADUATES AND COMMUNITIES OF PRACTICE

A. C. de Villiers
Music Education
Nelson Mandela University
Port Elizabeth, South Africa
e-mail: alethea.devilliers@mandela.ac.za

ABSTRACT

In this article, I present a literature study that provides the theoretical framework for my discussion. The theoretical framework offers a discourse of the broad policy framework relating to higher education and includes analysis and reflection on policy that informs the Bachelor of Music degree. In the literature framework I also discuss research on the topic of graduate music qualifications and how these can inform practice.

Curricula of the tertiary institutions that offer the Bachelor of Music degrees in South Africa do not appear to adequately consider future careers in their degree programmes. Alternatively, institutions have opted for vocational degrees in one field, namely the music industry, to the exclusion of other fields. In this essay, I present a possible alternate way of approaching curriculum development so that module outcomes in music curricula are purposefully focused on future careers. By following this approach, I contend that music graduates may be more employable, and be active members of communities of practice.

Keywords: music graduates, tertiary curricula, communities of practice

INTRODUCTION

In this essay, I will explore how music graduates can be prepared for the world of work and lifelong careers in music. By being able to pursue lifelong careers, graduates have the potential to make a positive contribution to society. As a point of departure, I describe the context of higher education today, after which I define the role of universities within the policy frameworks in South Africa. Finally, I provide a theoretical framework for curriculum development that takes into account current policy. While I use the curriculum framework of the music degrees of the Nelson Mandela University in this essay, my recommendations could have wider relevance.

UNIVERSITIES AND CURRENT EXPECTATIONS

The current role of universities globally has been described and debated by a number of researchers including Readings (1996), Pocklington and Tupper (2002), Kivinen (2002), Evans (2004), Peters (2010), Ginsberg (2011) and Rolfe (2013). These researchers all describe the

university as a corporate organisation in pursuit of excellence. In pursuing excellence, the university operates on an audit model. Due to this model academics are under pressure to be part of community engagement, to teach, and to produce research. Equally, there is pressure for student throughput and the resultant subsidy. Added to this, globally universities have experienced severe cuts in government funding. In order to generate funds, science faculties in particular embark on lucrative, commercial research projects in partnership with industry. The university benefits financially from these research projects which also leads to the sciences having more power within the university (Pocklington and Tupper 2002, 146–151). While these researchers report on practices in Canadian universities, they resonate with current practice in South Africa as well.

International research shows that one of the dangers of the mega-university has been the increase in bureaucracy. The bureaucratised institution has seen administration burgeoning with a concomitant shrinkage of permanent academic staff in favour of contract staff (Ginsberg 2011, 1–39). This reality is evident in South Africa (SA), where temporary staff reliance is growing. In SA, temporary staff grew by 34 per cent between 2007 and 2012, while permanent academic staff only increased by 10 per cent. For the period 2002–2012, the full-time equivalent (FTE) enrolments grew by 60 per cent and academic staff by 20 per cent (CHE 2016, 307).

Music departments are relatively small in terms of student numbers and staff complements, when compared with other academic departments. The activities of the music department such as one-on-one instrumental instruction, the student-to-staff ratio, and the utilisation of space, can result in this field being perceived as costly within an audit model. Added to this, despite the size of departments, music departments generally attempt to offer as many pathways for specialisation as possible.

In South Africa, the government funds those students enrolled for the arts at the highest level, 3.5, compared to other fields such as law and education where students are funded at level 1 (SA 2011, 24, 29).

The corporate university is run along business lines with a mission and vision statement, and lists graduate attributes. The vocabulary used in universities includes credit systems, funding models, cost centres, module outcomes and strategic planning. At institutions of higher education, there has also been a shift away from the old idea of particular canons of knowledge. This has been replaced with a more egalitarian approach, which is more inclusive. Knowledge is more market-driven and utilitarian; the knowledge taught and learnt at universities needs to be useful for economic purposes (Evans 2004, 16–23; Peters 2004, in Walker and Nixon 2004, 69–70, 73–78; Peters 2010).

The utilitarian approach to knowledge influences curricula, so that courses offered at

universities become more functional. In recent years, qualifications have been developed that are more vocationally oriented, to enable the employability of graduates to serve the economy. To meet the goals of employability, graduates also gather work-based experience while studying. With this comes the ideology of lifelong learning and protean careers, which are driven by the individual (Peters 2004, in Walker and Nixon 2004, 73–75; Delanty 2001, 108–110; Kivinen 2002, 191; Pocklington and Tupper 2002, 145).

This approach is also true for South Africa. De Villiers (2016) informs us that the *Draft National Plan for Higher Education in South Africa* (MoE 2001) influences curricula development at tertiary institutions. This document provides the framework for the development of qualifications; it also specifies that tertiary institutions should offer relevant qualifications that can lead to human resource development, and respond to societal needs and interests. In addition, there is the expectation that universities engage in high skills training to strengthen enterprises, services and infrastructure, and to be engaged with the production, acquisition and application of new knowledge through research (MoE 2001).

SAQA has also identified attributes that focus on the employability of the graduates. These attributes are influenced by four broad interrelated components: (1) skillful practices (communication skills, time management; self-management and resource management, problem-solving and lifelong learning); (2) deep understanding rooted in a discipline (specialised expertise in a field of knowledge); (3) realistic understanding about personal identity and self-worth and; (4) metacognition (self-awareness and the capacity for reflection) (Yorke and Knight 2006, 5 as cited by Griesel and Parker 2009, 5).

This essay focuses on the music department at Nelson Mandela University. Where applicable, and to build my thesis, I will make comparisons with other tertiary institutions in South Africa. Nelson Mandela University (NMU) is one of a few universities in this country that has adopted a comprehensive list of graduate attributes derived from the SAQA guidelines (Griesel and Parker 2009). These graduate attributes are similar to the values and dispositions from our constitution (SA 1996). The attributes that graduates from our university should have are: (1) in-depth disciplinary/interdisciplinary knowledge; (2) social awareness and responsible citizenship; (3) adaptive expertise; (4) creativity and innovation; (5) critical thinking; (6) intra- and interpersonal skills and; (7) communication skills (http://www.nmmu.ac.za/). These graduate attributes are intended to inform curricula and the learning outcomes for graduates in academic departments. Notwithstanding the emphasis on job-related skills, in both policies and graduate attributes, these do not always filter down to the level of academic departments and so they do not feature in course outcomes.

Generally speaking, one could say that the purpose of the university has not changed – the

core business prevails: it is teaching and learning, albeit with different outcomes (Readings 1996, 64; Peters 2010, 151). Kivinen (2002, 191), citing Cobban (1975), reminds us that the role of universities has come full circle in that today they fulfil a similar role to the one they had in their origins in the Middle Ages, when their purpose was to educate individuals for their chosen careers.

Educating for democratic citizenship also entails inculcating basic democratic principles such as tolerance, honesty, and a predisposition to non-violence (Gutmann 1987, 173). To these traits one can add respect for the law, self-discipline, fairness, co-operation, empathy, trust, and benevolence (Gutmann 1987, 58, 61) as these characteristics are necessary to live in a democratic society. Gutmann (1987, 173) is of the opinion that if young people have not developed these character traits by the time they enter university, it is too late to develop them at the tertiary education level. Gutmann suggests that the only way dispositions necessary for living in a democratic society can be developed at this late stage, would be if the academics allow students to think critically about political and social problems, to express their views and defend them in front of people who have different ideas. This type of moral education is well-suited to universities and students are receptive to this kind of engagement.

In addition to class debates and discussions, students can also participate in student societies. At NMU, students are able to develop a co-curricular record through participation in such societies, which can help them develop the temperament for active citizenship. In my opinion, a means of ensuring appropriate student behaviour is to reinforce rules and codes of conduct at departmental level, and within the broader university.

ADMISSION POLICIES

Amy Gutmann (1987, 194–204), writes that in a democratic society higher education needs to be distributed to a large number of people. Universities should therefore use a variety of criteria to determine access. Admission policies should allow for a more intellectually diverse student body, by admitting students with less than the average high school grades, in order to maximise the academic contribution of university students. Gutmann (1987, 207–218) adds that universities should seek diversity in their student body to enrich the intellectual life of the institution. Admissions policies at a number of South African universities make provision for redress and access for socially-disadvantaged students, in recognition of the dysfunctional school education system. Admissions policies of some universities also allocate additional points for social disadvantage. This ensures that a larger number of students, including those whose marks are lower, are able to access tertiary education. Although NMU appears to have the lowest minimum admission-point score (APS) – namely 22 – academic departments have

developed their own admission criteria, including specified subjects and marks attained as well as their own APS score. In most instances, this differs from, and is considerably higher than the APS score published in the general prospectus (Nelson Mandela University Prospectus, 2017). Policies concerned with redress and improved access in South Africa, do not apply to Bachelor of Music students, as they are typically from the privileged quintiles four and five and have been studying music for at least nine years prior to registering at university. Added to this, these students come with the rich experiences of extra-curricular involvement in a number of societies (SA 2006).

At NMU, the Bachelor of Music degree requires that prospective students have30 APS points with specific subject requirements and marks in their home language or first additional language and mathematics or mathematics literacy and music practical at grade 6 level and music theory at grade 5 level. When one considers the requirements of music technology, especially when it is a specialisation, the entry requirements should be mathematics and not mathematics literacy. If music technology is an elective for other degree specialisations, then the content and assessment requirements should be manageable for students with mathematics literacy. In exceptional cases, the graded requirements are waived. This is typically for students who demonstrate a high level of performance, and been part of community music projects, but without the requisite graded exams.

A review of module outcomes reflects a narrow focus on the understanding of the content of the modules, and not sufficient scope for application of the content. Application of the content and assessment that requires application of content would be more future-focused towards the relevance of the module within broader careers in music. It is my contention that music curricula should move students towards possible future careers beyond being extensions of high school. It is cause for concern that curricula appear to be either developed without due consideration of broader policy initiatives, or that, as policies changed, they are not adapted. In the discussion that follows, I will provide a literature review on research in music education, which offers a different perspective on how to approach curriculum development for Bachelor of Music degrees. This is followed by a discussion of the policy framework in South Africa as well as a proposal for how one could approach curriculum development.

GRADUATE MUSIC QUALIFICATIONS: PERSPECTIVES FROM RESEARCH

In the discussion that follows, I make the connection between research discussed previously and how it is applicable to music education. Previous research highlighted, (1) a utilitarian approach to knowledge, to ensure the employability of graduates; (2) graduates need to be multi-skilled in order to follow protean careers; (3) students should develop work-based

experience while studying. Researchers in music education have also identified the need for music graduates to develop market-related or vocational skills. These findings correlate with international and national government policies. A number of researchers in music education have also identified the need for music graduates to develop diverse and transferable skills. De Villiers (2016) cites Lebler, Burt-Perkins and Carey (2009, 233), Bridgstock (2005, 2009, 32–37), Bridgstock (2011, 12-13) and Lebler (2007, 206) who advocate that music departments should aim for their students to develop musically-inclusive skills as well as being multi-skilled so that they become self-monitoring and self-directing, adaptable graduates active across diverse music activities. These transferable skills relates to the workplace skills such as those described by Fallows and Steven (2000, 75–76) and by Bartleet, Bennett, Bridgstock, Draper, Harrison and Schippers (2012, 36–37). The attributes described by these researchers also resonate with some of the graduate attributes identified by SAQA, namely that graduates should manage themselves and resources as well as having in depth discipline knowledge.

THE INTERPLAY OF COMMUNITIES OF PRACTICE AND FIELDS OF MUSIC

Researchers writing about music degrees resonate with policies in so far as they refer to the purpose of the qualifications in terms of employment opportunities for music graduates. Renshaw (2002) identifies the four main vocational roles music graduates will have in the world of work – composer, performer, leader and teacher.

Burnard (2012), on the other hand, extends this notion of vocational roles when she outlines the possible roles within the fields of music. De Villiers (2016) cites Burnard (2012, 216), who draws on Bourdieu's (1984) definition of fields, expanding upon this definition and redefining it. Burnard identifies the fields of music, technology, industries, commerce and cultural production and social spaces and redefines each of these within the context of music, as (1) styles of music, (2) technology, (3) industry, (4) commerce, and (5) cultural production and social spaces. Burnard's description provides a more detailed one than Renshaw (2002) and also refers to intersections and overlaps across the fields of music, which alludes to both specialist and generic skills that are transferable across these five fields.

Wenger – although not writing about music – describes communities of practice (1988, 6). This concept can be applied to music, contending that everyone is part of communities of practice (Wenger 1998, 6). The central thesis of Wenger's book is that, for individuals, learning is an issue of engaging in and contributing to the practices of their communities. For the communities it means that learning provides them with the opportunity of "refining their practice and ensuring new generations of members" (Wenger 1998, 7). The benefits for the organisation are that learning becomes a means "of sustaining the interconnected communities

of practice through which an organisation" defines itself and can be "effective and valuable" (Wenger 1998, 7–8). The author (1998, 3) also addresses the issue of how we approach learning and, proposes that we position learning within the context of lived experiences in the real world. For Wenger this would be the communities of practice (he also includes an assessment of that learning) and according to him, a community of practice exists within a historical and social context that gives structure and meaning to our practice (1998, 46–47). In this essay, communities of practice will refer to the communities that exist within the field of music and where musicians are active, such as symphony orchestras, recording studios and community of music teachers.

The idea of facilitating graduates to work in different fields was initially introduced by Hall who coined the term "protean career" to describe this phenomenon. Hall (1996) suggests that tertiary institutions should provide students with opportunities to explore different paths as opposed to presenting them with a fixed programme of study. The author contends that as conditions in the work environment change, individuals need to be adaptable and take responsibility for enhancing their employability (Hall 1996, 8–10).

It is widely recognised that within the different genres of music, musicians constantly move across multiple fields that intersect and overlap with each other (Burnard 2012, 217). Performers of all genres interact with technology and commerce, and they perform within social spaces. Burnard (2012, 214– 215) reminds us that all fields have rules, histories and legends within the different genres of music. Musicians need to have an understanding of these if they wish to move across fields. For example, being an orchestral player is different to playing in the church band. Not only do the social spaces differ, but they will require a different repertoire. The common skills that these spaces necessitate are: discipline knowledge (music), which manifests itself in the ability to read music such as music scores and chord charts; performance competence; and the ability to learn new music independently. Besides these, musicians would also need generic skills such as communication skills, self-management, time management, co-operative skills and the ability to work with other people. These resonate with the graduate attributes of both NMU and those identified by the South African Qualifications Authority (Griesel and Parker 2009).

Wenger (1998, 103, 105) also recognises the interdependence of communities of practice and refers to this articulation from one community of practice to another as multi-membership. The lived experiences and expertise of staff in any music department can include playing in an orchestra; leading ensembles; performing solo or as an accompanist; teaching music; or being a researcher. Academic staff in music departments have membership of diverse communities of practice in which they take different roles and, as such, they know the histories and rules of

the various fields into which they can initiate their students.

Perkins (2012, 15) concurs with both Burnard (2014) and Wenger (1998) when she states that it is important that music students develop multiple and fluid identities. Carruthers (2012, 82) agrees with Perkins when he speaks about the versatility of musicians and goes on to state that versatility "cannot be cultivated coincidentally or collaterally ... it must be intentionally learned". Carruthers says that music students need to gain a combination of skills that are inclusive of musical, academic, technological, entrepreneurial and networking abilities.

Carey and Lebler (2012, 10), as well as Lebler and Weston (2015, 132–133), advocate that in degree courses, the number of compulsory modules be reduced after the first year of study, so that students can enrol for electives that are not part of the music degree. When students are able to select free choice electives, they can take responsibility for their own learning and map out their own future career paths. By following this approach students enrolled at their institution were able to choose cross-disciplinary and interdisciplinary specialisations in secondary music education, business marketing, or multimedia. This relates to Bennett's (2007) notion that music departments need to expand their definition of "musician" to be more pertinent to real-world careers. The researcher also advocates that there should be more interaction between music staff and industry. Subsequently, Bennett (2012, 242) advocates that students themselves need to redefine what it means to be a musician. She claims that this will help them take responsibility for the choices they make towards their future careers.

Lebler and Weston (2015, 125) experimented with a learning-centred approach that utilises the diverse abilities of its students, shifting the responsibility of learning to the students themselves. This multi-faceted approach includes collaborative learning among students, studying with lecturers, and experience in external contexts, such as with band performers. I am of the opinion that we should not confine learning to the traditional lecture room, but should embrace a wide variety of platforms including the internet and YouTube videos, online master classes on performance and composition in addition to open access sources, which can serve to expand the expertise and communities of practice that the students can experience.

Bridgstock (2011, 14) is of the opinion that institutions cannot provide a perfect match of skills for students as they are unable to prepare students for every possible career; instead, she states that staff should assist students in taking responsibility for their career development. The role of the university would be to provide students with the opportunities to make those decisions.

From the aforegoing discussion, it is clear that researchers in music education support the idea that music degrees should prepare graduates for a lifelong engagement in music. They

propose a variety of ways in which to do this. De Villiers (2016), references a number of researchers who propose the following: (1) degree courses should be flexible allowing for more choice with regard to subjects (Perkins 2014, 224–231; Lebler and Weston 2015); (2) skills and attributes need for careers should influence degree courses (Bennett 2014, 234–235); (3) students should develop transferable skills (Bridgstock 2005; 2009; 2011); and (4) students should be exposed to learner-centred methodologies (Lebler and Weston 2015).

Bennett, Reid and Rowley (2017, 461) note that the formal education at universities does not enable students to become part of professional communities of practice. To develop identities in communities of practice, music students would need to participate in work-integrated learning (WIL). This would mean that the development of curricula and the subsequent criteria for assessment of their learning be derived from the fields of practice, such as orchestral or ensemble performance, recording studio, music education and so forth. Furthermore, internship or work-integrated learning (WIL) then becomes a means of identity development within a professional community of practice. However, Bennett et al. (2017, 471) caution that WIL needs to be meaningful so that students apply their knowledge and skills to develop professional skills and dispositions for possible future careers. While the research under discussion provides powerful insights into how one can approach the development of music degrees, the researchers are writing from different contexts to ours. In the section that follows I will (1) contextualise the BMus degree within our policy frameworks, (2) discuss and compare BMus degrees in South Africa, and (3) apply the theoretical framework and policies to articulate an alternate approach to how a South African university could develop a BMus degree.

THE BACHELOR OF MUSIC DEGREE IN SOUTH AFRICA

SAQA (2016) supports the idea of vocation-oriented qualifications. The generic BMus that it has registered aims to qualify students for vocations in music, through specialisation. Additionally, this degree is career-focused as SAQA has identified performer, arranger, composer, researcher, music technologist and music educator as specialisations (SAQA 2016). This framework was developed by means of a consultative process that included academics, teachers and members of the music industry. The BMus degree was initially registered with the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) in 2007 with re-registration in 2012 and 2015 (SAQA 2016; Leal 2014, 86).

The Music degree has 480 credits and is at NQF level 8. SAQA divides the credits into 100 fundamental credits, 200 core credits plus a minimum of 180 elective credits. Of these elective credits, 100 can be music electives for specialisation and 80 can be non-music credits

(SAQA 2016). SAQA states that students can specialise in both a specific branch of music, such as music technology, and in interdisciplinary and cross-disciplinary fields (SAQA 2016). SAQA also informs us that this qualification exists so that institutions can develop their curricula to ensure: (1) student portability; (2) the promotion of entrepreneurship; (3) broad economic development; (4) that music industry requirements are met; and (5) that the choice of majors or specialisations is left to the universities (SAQA 2016). This framework is very comparable to the previous discussion on music qualifications.

Table 1: A tabular representation of the generic SAQA BMus degree

Fundamental credits	100	Personal management and social responsibility (10); Technical proficiency and instrumental performance (55); Aural skills (35)
Core credits	200	Music analysis (60); Research (40); Music history including African music (60); Perform in an ensemble (40)
Elective credits	100	Music credits for specialisation, e.g. performance (100) OR research (100) OR composition and arrangement (100) OR music technology (100) OR music education (100)
	80	Non-music credits

From this tabular presentation, one can deduce what are the main requirements for a BMus degree. A narrow interpretation of the SAQA framework could lead to the core for any student to be performance, both solo and in ensemble, music theory and analysis and the context in which music is both composed and performed, which is history. In any community of practice the musician would need a working knowledge of some of the components expressed in the elective credits. The SAQA framework is open for interpretation by the tertiary institutions. A specific interpretation can lead to degrees that have such a limited focus that students may not for instance engage with composition or research at an advanced level, if these steams are only available for specialisation. In such a scenario, music graduates would therefore have insufficient skills and competences to be able to move fluidly across different communities of practice. The 80 non-music credits, as suggested in the SAQA framework, paves the way for interdisciplinary and cross-disciplinary studies. Moreover, these "free electives" would enable students to enrol for a second "school" subject that would enable students to register for the post-graduate certificate in education (PGCE) (*Government Gazette* 2015, 26–33). On completion of the PGCE, music teachers could register with the professional body.

Ten universities in SA have music departments. Of these, five institutions chose to register Bachelor of Music degrees against the SAQA framework, while the remaining five registered institutional degrees. In my analysis of the BMus degrees, I have discovered that the tertiary institutions did not closely follow the framework as set out in the SAQA document. NMU, Free State University (UFS), University of Cape Town (UCT), Rhodes University (RU) and the

University of Kwazulu-Natal (UKZN) adopted different approaches to this framework.[1]

The curricula of UKZN, UFS and RU are the closest to SAQA, in that each institution registered one degree with specialisations. UKZN has nine specialisations and UFS, five. At both these universities, specialisation happens in years three and four. At UKZN electives are limited to music modules, and at UFS students only have access to 32 non-music credits, which is less than the SAQA model. All the other electives are music related. RU has one degree with specialisations. Both UCT and NMU followed similar frameworks in that the degrees are specialised from the outset. UCT registered four degrees and NMU five degrees.

NMU offers a general degree, an interdisciplinary degree and specialised degrees in technology, performance and music education. UCT offers specialised degrees in performance in different style of music. These are classical, jazz, African music, and composition in the Western classical style. These specialised degrees result in students not being able to access modules from other specialisations. In practice, this means that only some degrees have business components and or technology and composition.

With the exception of the interdisciplinary degree offered by NMU, the five institutions do not create the space for students to enrol for the second "school subject". In other words, they have not included the 80 non-music credits in the course structure. What the curricula of these five institutions have in common with the SAQA framework is that they use the SAQA vocabulary of specialisations, core modules, fundamental and elective modules.

In South Africa, the alternative for the development of qualifications was for institutions to register an institutional degree. This is the path taken by the other five universities with music departments, which are the University of Stellenbosch (US), University of Pretoria (UP), North West University (NWU) in Potchefstroom, Tshwane University of Technology (TUT) and the University of the Witwatersrand (Wits).[2]

UP, US and NWU offer structured, BMus degrees. In these degrees students follow a specific specialisation or stream and have limited access to enrol for electives. In contrast, both TUT and Wits registered vocation qualifications that are geared for employment in the music and creative industries respectively. The BMus at Wits is both interdisciplinary and cross-disciplinary and has sufficient "free electives" for the students to enrol for the second "school subject".

De Villiers (2016) refers to Leal (2014, 82–83) who states that data gathered from his interviews with representatives from the South African music industry, correlates with government policy. The respondents in his study, recommend that music degrees should (1) be student-focused with flexible curricula, to meet the needs of the market; (2) include music business skills, marketing and branding; (3) include entrepreneurial skills; (4) include music

technology; (5) have curricula that are more relevant and in line with the needs of the music industry; (6) enable students to qualify as teachers; and (7) provide students with opportunities to participate in work-based learning experiences (WIL). Similar to findings from international research, described previously, representatives from industry also desired a closer working relationship with academic departments (Leal 2014, 198). These findings also echo international research discussed previously.

Given the current policy guidelines in South Africa as well as global trends, that promote the idea of graduate employability, staff in music departments should familiarise themselves with policies and related research so that curriculum development and reform occurs within a policy framework. Furthermore, academics need to consider the communities of practice in which students will either find employment or create employment opportunities for themselves and others. Drawing from the research mentioned earlier, the ideal would be for music graduates to be generalists and specialists who can move across to other fields. A suggested framework for a proposed BMus degree more closely based on the SAQA framework and which differs substantially from current course offerings is presented in the table that follows.

Table 2: Proposed framework for a BMus degree based on the SAQA framework

Year	Music credits	Other credits
Year 1 (120 credits)	96 (extended fundamental and core)	24 Business
Year 2 (120 credits)	96 (extended fundamental and core)	24 non-music elective
Year 3 (128 credits)	88 (extended fundamental and core)	40 non-music elective
Year 4 (120 credits)	120 (specialisation) +WIL	
	Total of 400 music credits	Total of 88 non-music credits

In this framework, music graduates would complete 400 music credits in total. From first to third year, students would complete 280 generic music credits that represent an expanded interpretation of fundamental and core. This expanded fundamental and core would include instrumental performance, both individual and in ensemble, leading an ensemble in rehearsal and performance, integrating music history with theory, form, analysis and aural, with the addition of music technology. Music technology can be embedded across the curriculum. For example, students could complete theory worksheets / harmonies / compositions using software. A more comprehensive exploration of musicianship over a three year period would potentially enable graduates to develop broad-based music skills to develop identities in different fields of music or communities of practice and would allow them to move across different fields of music (genres, technology, industries, commerce, cultural production and social spaces), and possibly the arts.

The fourth year could be for specialisation in a field of music such as music technology, musicology, performance, composition and arrangement or education. This fourth year could also include WIL. Additionally, in this framework, students would be able to enrol for 88 non-music credits. In an alternate model, one could limit the music credits to 300. One would then have 100 credits available for interdisciplinary or cross-disciplinary studies. This is closer to the SAQA model and has eight extra credits to accommodate the second "school" subject as well as a business module, in addition to 20 extra credits for specialisation.

DEVELOPING THE CURRICULUM FOR THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT

There is universal consensus as to what is central to a music degree. Performance on an instrument, music history and theory are considered the core of any Bachelor of Music degree. However, modules for the core of music are often developed without considering higher order cognitive competences such as applying the knowledge, evaluating or synthesising. It is widely acknowledged that music history, music theory (harmony) and analysis are interrelated. One should be able to determine the purpose of each component within the core. One could therefore state that the reason music theory (harmony) and analysis are included is so that students can develop competences for composition and arrangement. Similarly, the purpose of music history is to contextualise performance practices and tonality within societies. In determining the assessment of music theory one could then focus on creativity, including the compilation of a portfolio of compositions and arrangements. There are a number of ways of engaging with music history, including organising it around composers, themes, social issues or, most typically, chronologically according to date and eras. The focus of history of music, besides contextualising theory and harmony, can be to develop academic writing skills over the course of the degree. The approach followed in history modules should then be on the future purpose as opposed to how much content was included.

Instrumental performance within the field of music – albeit African, classical, jazz or popular music – is usually viewed as a means to develop repertoire, music literacies and technical proficiencies. A different approach to teaching and learning, could be to focus instrumental performance on developing competences for the vocations students can pursue. Possible future careers could include conductor, teacher, librarian (archivist), music journalist (crit), ensemble performer, including orchestra or chamber musician and accompanist. Some vocations require competences that are genre-specific while other competences overlap across different styles of music. To this core, one could add the basic technological skills needed by a teacher, musicologist, performer and composer. For instance, in the assessment, using music technology to complete theory worksheets, harmony as well as the use of Mobile Applications

across the curriculum.

To avoid a proliferation of modules I would recommend that music departments broadly-band subjects together that consist of a number of modules. Subjects would be broadly-banded with increasing numbers of credits over each year of study, either in multiples of four, such as 24, 40, and 60, or in multiples of five. Each subject would consist of a number of modules. A student would need to pass all the modules of the subject in order to progress to the next year of study. One of the core subjects in any music degree is instrumental performance, which could possibly consist of a number of modules, including performance, leading and ensemble playing and/or accompaniment modules. In the framework provided previously, I have opted for modules to be organised around multiples of four.

In the process of curriculum development, I have adopted Burnard's idea of the field of music and its related competences as a point of departure. Moreover, I would begin by attempting to answer the question: "Why do we educate for music performance in ... (jazz, classical, African or popular music)?" Academics could then list the knowledge and skills required to be an excellent performer. By so doing one can develop generic, as well as specific, criteria or outcomes that relate to the communities of practice. It is important to bear in mind that one needs to guard against equating different music styles with each other. The first violinist in an orchestra, a jazz pianist, classical pianist or a marimba player have generic competences, but each specialisation also requires specific and very divergent competences. Some of the genres or styles of music overlap naturally so common criteria can be developed in addition to genre-specific criteria. These genres or fields of music all intersect with technology, commerce, performance spaces or fields of cultural production and industries in real-life communities of practice.

Specialisations are dependent on the staff in the music department. Furthermore, specialisations also impact on the cost of qualifications. Music departments could use the SAQA framework and the fields of music identified by Burnard (2014) to develop these specialisations. Alternately, inter-disciplinary and cross-disciplinary specialisations could be considered. In the development of specialisations there should be consultation with members of the communities of practice, including opportunities for students to gain relevant WIL experience. Academic departments should not lose sight of the fact that graduates will become members of communities of practice. If one were to follow the framework presented below, it would be possible for students to return to university to complete additional modules within a lifelong career in music, as it is based on our modular system (CHE 2013, 109).

Table 3: Proposed framework for year four specialisations: BMus degree based on the SAQA framework

Year four: Specialisations: 120 credits		
	Specialisation stream (60 credits)	**Generic music modules (60 credits)**
Performing Arts	Music Performance (60 credits)	Research (20 credits) WIL (10 credits)
Education	Music Education (60 credits)	Performance Main Instrument (30 credits) (These 30 credits are to be interpreted differently for performing arts)
Composition	Composition, arranging and orchestration (60 credits)	
Technology	Music Technology (60 credits)	
Musicology	Musicology (60 credits)	

In this table, I have identified streams or specialisations, which would follow on from the generic three years of study as presented in Table 2. In contrast to the literature I do not think it feasible to allow students to choose from a collection of modules so as to construct their own degrees. Instead, as Table 2 and the discussion illustrates, students would complete generic modules as well as specialisations in year four. To gain entry into a stream at fourth year level would necessitate that students demonstrate competence in their third year of study. In Table 3, I have opted to name one degree performing arts and not to lable it classical, jazz, African or popular. The student may present with the specialised genre. The specialisation of genre will also be dependent on staffing and other resources for both practical and theoretical subjects. Added to this, the outcomes for performances could be generic and applied specifically as music academics are knowledgeable about the histories and conventions of their areas of expertise. In this model, the performing arts stream, like the other specialisations, has 30 credits for main instrument. These 30 credits could be utilised for developing advanced skills in performances in ensembles, such playing in the orchestra, bands, African music ensembles, and or developing accompanying skills for classical pianists. Most performing art graduates do not make successful careers as solo performers. While they can prepare for a solo career, it would be more pragmatic to pursue other careers in the performing arts that require high level of performance competences. The research component prepares students for post-graduate studies. For this reason, I would motivate that the research topic be linked to the area of specialisation.

CONCLUDING THOUGHTS

In this essay, I provided a theoretical study to contextualise curriculum development in music in tertiary institutions in South Africa, within the framework of vocations. I have also articulated a framework for curriculum renewal in music that begins with the purpose of the core competences and the knowledge and skills that graduates should develop for careers in music. The literature informs us that globally universities follow business models and adopt a

utilitarian approach to knowledge and qualifications. I therefore think that music academics need to follow a more pragmatic approach to curriculum development. By so doing, they will ensure that their students can become members of communities of practice.

NOTES

1. Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University. 2015. *Music.* https://www.nmmu.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    University of Free State. 2015. *Faculty of the Humanities*. http://humanities.ufs.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    University of Cape Town. 2015. *Introducing the Faculty of Humanities*. http://www.uct.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    Rhodes University. 2015. *Music and Musicology*. http://www.ru.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    University of Kwazulu-Natal. 2015. *Discipline of Music*. http://music.ukzn.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

2. Stellenbosch University. 2015. *Faculty of Arts.* http://www.sun.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    University of Pretoria. 2015. *Music.* http://www.up.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    North West University. 2015. *Music.* http://nwumusic.co.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    Tshwane University of Technology. 2016. *Faculty of the Arts.* http://www.tut.ac.za/ Prospectus/2016/faculties/arts.htm (Accessed 11 November 2015).

    University of the Witwatersrand. 2015. *Wits Music Prospectus 2015.* http://www.wits.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 November 2015).

REFERENCES

Bartleet, B. L., D. Bennett, R. Bridgstock, P. Draper, S. Harrison and H. Schippers. 2012. Preparing for portfolio careers in Australian music: Setting a research agenda. *Australian Journal of Music Education* 1: 32–41.

Bennett, D. 2007. Utopia for music performance graduates. It is achievable, and how should it be defined? *British Journal of Music Education* 24(2): 179–189.

Bennett, D. 2014 The role of career creativities in developing identity and becoming expert selves. In *Developing creativities in higher music education. International perspectives and practices*, ed. Pamela Burnard, 234–244. London: Routledge Research in Higher Education Series.

Bennett, D., A. Reid and J. Rowley. 2017. Student musicians' experiences of reflexivity during internships: Personal narratives and complex modalities. *International Journal of Music* 3593: 460–475.

Bridgstock, R. 2005. Australian artists, starving and well-nourished: What can we learn from the prototypical protean career? *Australian Journal of Career Development* 14(3): 40–48.

Bridgstock, R. 2009. The graduate attributes we've overlooked: Enhancing graduate employability through career management skills. *Higher Education Research and Development* 28(1): 31–44.

Bridgstock, R. 2011. Skills for creative graduate success. *Education and Training* 53(1): 9–26.

Burnard, P. 2012. *Musical creativities in practice.* United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.

Burnard, P. 2014. Championing the significance of creativities in higher music education. In *Developing creativities in higher music education. International perspectives and practices*, ed. Pamela Burnard, 3–10. London: Routledge Research in Higher Education Series.

Carey, G. and D. Lebler. 2012. Reforming a Bachelor of Music programme: A case study. *International Journal of Music Education*: 1–16.

Carruthers, G. 2012. Musicians in society. Making the connection. In *Life in the real world: How to make music graduates employable*, ed. D. Bennett, 79–97. Common Ground Publishing LLC.

CHE. 2013. *A proposal for undergraduate curriculum reform in South Africa: The case for a flexible curriculum structure.* http://www.che.ac.za/ (Accessed 11 January 2015).

CHE. 2016. *South African higher education reviewed. Two decades of democracy.* http://www.che.ac.za/ (Accessed 23 August 2017).

Delanty, G. 2001 *Challenging knowledge. The university in the knowledge society.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

De Villiers, A. C. 2016. Peer reviewed International Conference Proceedings Publication, ISME Commission in Birmingham, UK. "*Adapt or die in the creative arts: The case for protean careers.*"

Evans, M. 2004. *Killing thinking.* London: Continuum.

Fallows, S. and C. Steven. 2000. Building employability skills into the higher education curriculum: A university-wide initiative. *Education and Training* 42(2): 75–83.

Government Gazette. 2015. Revised policy on the minimum requirements for Teacher Education Qualifications. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Ginsberg, B. 2011. *The fall of the faculty. The rise of the all-administrative university and why it matters.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Griesel, H. and B. Parker. 2009. *Graduate attributes. A baseline study on South African graduates from the perspective of employers.* Pretoria: Higher Education South Africa – HESA.

Gutmann, A. 1987. *Democratic education.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Hall, D. T. 1996. Protean careers of the 21st century. *The Academy of Management Executive (1993–2005* 10(4): 8–16.

Kivinen, O. 2002. Higher learning in an age of uncertainty. In *Higher education in a globalizing world*, ed. J. Enders and O. Fulton, 191–206. Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Leal, S. R. 2014. Tertiary music education in South Africa: Meeting the needs of music students and the music industry. University of Pretoria: Unpublished Masters dissertation.

Lebler, D. 2007. Student-as-master? Reflections on a learning innovation in popular music pedagogy. *International Journal of Music Education* 25(3): 205–221.

Lebler, D., R. Burt-Perkins and G. Carey. 2009. What students bring: Examining the attributes of commencing conservatoire students. *International Journal of Music Education* 27(3): 232–249.

Lebler, D. and D. Weston. 2015. Staying in sync: Keeping popular music pedagogy relevant to an evolving music industry. *Journal of the International Association for the Study of Popular Music* 5(1): 124–138.

Ministry of Education. 2001. *Draft National Plan for higher education in South Africa.* Pretoria: Government Printer.

MoE *see* Ministry of Education.

Nelson Mandela University. 2017. *Faculty of Arts Prospectus.* https://www.mandela.ac.za (Accessed 1 September 2017).

Perkins, R. 2012. Rethinking "career" for music students. Identity and vision. In *Life in the real world: How to make music graduates employable*, ed. D. Bennett, 11–26. Common Ground Publishing LLC.

Perkins, R. 2014. Learning cultures, creativities and higher music education institutions. In *Developing creativities in higher music education,* ed. P. Burnard, 223-233. London: Routledge Research in Higher Education Series.

Peters, M. A. 2004. Higher education, globalization and the knowledge economy. In *Reclaiming universities from a runaway world*, ed. M. Walker and J. Nixon. Berkshire: Open University Press.

Peters, M. A. 2010. Re-imagining the university in the global era. *Policy Futures in Education* 8(2): 151–165.

Pocklington, T. and A. Tupper. 2002. *No place to learn. Why universities aren't working.* Vancouver: UBC Press.

Readings, B. 1996. *The university in ruins.* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Renshaw, P. 2002. Remaking the conservatorium agenda. http://musicinaustralia.org.au/ (Accessed 14 October 2015).

Rolfe, G. 2013. *The university in dissent. Scholarship in the corporate university.* London: Routledge.

SAQA. 2016. *Bachelor of Music.* http://allqa.saqa.org.za/ (Accessed 11 January 2016).

SA *see* South Africa.

South Africa. 1996. *Constitution of South Africa.* Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa. 2006. *South African Schools Act, 1996. (Act No 84 of 1996), Amended National Norms and Standards for School Funding.* Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa. 2011. *Higher Education Funding in South Africa.* Pretoria: Government Printer.

Walker, M. and J. Nixon. (Eds.). 2004. *Reclaiming universities from a runaway world.* Berkshire: Open University Press.

Wenger, E. 1998. *Communities of practice.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.